



Board of Trustees Meeting

University of North Florida

Thursday, July 11, 2024 at 12:00 PM to 1:00 PM

Virtual

Agenda

- I. **Call to Order**
- II. **Public Comment**
- III. **President's Remarks** **12:00 PM**
- IV. **Post Tenure Review Audit Report** **12:05 PM**

Julia Hann, Chief Audit Executive, will present the Post Tenure Review Internal Audit Report. BOG Regulation 10.003, Post-Tenure Faculty Review, requests each university board of trustees to consider the audit report after the report's publication date.

Proposed Action: No Action Required

- V. **Tenure Upon Hire – Stephen W. Dittmore, Ph.D., Professor and (Incoming) Dean, College of Education and Human Services** **12:15 PM**

Following a national search and strong support by the College faculty, Dr. Stephen Dittmore was selected as Dean of the College of Education and Human Services, beginning July 22, 2024. Dr. Dittmore holds a Ph.D. in Educational Leadership and Organizational Development from the University of Louisville, and most recently served as Professor and Dean of the College of Education and Health Sciences at Baldwin Wallace University in Berea, Ohio.

Provost Karen Patterson will present this item.

Proposed Action: Approval; Motion and Second Required

- VII. **2025-2026 Legislative Budget Request** **12:20 PM**

President Limayem will present UNF's 2025-2026 Legislative Budget Requests which requires Board of Trustee approval prior to submission to the Board of Governors.

Proposed Action: Approval; Motion and Second Required

- VIII. **Adjournment** **12:40 PM**

June 20, 2024

Final

Internal Audit Report 2024.08

Post-Tenure Faculty Review



Issued to:

Board of Trustees:
Kevin Hyde (chair), Michael Barcal, Jason Barrett, Mike Binder, Jill Davis, Jay Demetree, Annie Egan, John Gol, Allison Korman Shelton, Christopher Lazzara, Paul McElroy, Steve Moore, and Nik Patel

President: Moez Limayem

Provost and Vice President for Academic and Student Affairs: Karen Patterson

Associate Vice President, Strategy and Implementation: Karen Cousins

Senior Associate Provost for Faculty and Research: John Kantner

Issued by:

Julia Hann,
Chief Audit Executive

Auditor:

Jillian Litchfield,
Senior Internal Auditor

Table of Contents

Background	3
Audit Objective	3
Scope and Methodology	3
Prior Audit Recommendations	4
Conclusion	4
Appendix I	5
Post-Tenure Review Faculty Outcomes	5
Appendix II	6
Report and Item Ranking Scale	6

Background

In 2022, the Florida Legislature amended Section 1001.706, Florida Statutes, authorizing the Florida Board of Governors (BOG) to adopt a post-tenure review regulation requiring each tenured state university faculty member to undergo a comprehensive post-tenure review every five years. The BOG then adopted Regulation 10.003, Post-Tenure Faculty Review, which states, in part, that “each university must conduct an audit of the comprehensive post-tenure review process for the prior fiscal year and submit a final report to the university’s Board of Trustees by July 1.” The regulation further states, “The auditor must provide the university board of trustees with a report that includes the following:

- a. The number of tenured faculty in each of the four performance rating categories [as follows]:
 1. **Exceeds expectations:** a clear and significant level of accomplishment beyond the average performance of faculty across the faculty member’s discipline and unit.
 2. **Meets expectations:** expected level of accomplishment compared to faculty across the faculty member’s discipline and unit.
 3. **Does not meet expectations:** performance falls below the normal range of annual variation in performance compared to faculty across the faculty member’s discipline and unit but is capable of improvement.
 4. **Unsatisfactory:** failure to meet expectations that reflect disregard or failure to follow previous advice of other efforts to provide correction or assistance, or performance involves incompetence or misconduct as defined in applicable university regulations and policies.
- b. The university’s response in cases of each category.
- c. Findings of non-compliance with applicable state laws, Board of Governors’ regulations, and university regulations and policies.”

Audit Objective

The objectives of the audit were to evaluate:

- Compliance with Florida Board of Governors Regulation 10.003, and its requirements for a comprehensive post-tenure faculty review.
- Effectiveness of the review process and its alignment with University’s policies and procedures.

Scope and Methodology

The scope of this audit included data utilized for the University’s first post-tenure faculty review (PTR). To satisfy our objectives, we performed the following:

- Evaluated UNF Policy 2.1100P, Post-Tenure Faculty Review, and UNF-UFF Post-Tenure Faculty Review Memo of Understanding (MOU) for compliance with Board of Governors (BOG) Regulation 10.003, Post-Tenure Faculty Review.
- Gained an understanding of Section 1012.91, Florida Statutes, Personnel Records and UNF Regulation 4.0030R, Limited Access Personnel Records.
- Verified accuracy of tenured faculty population.
- Validated selection process of tenured faculty for the review.
- Ensured timing of communications with faculty regarding the selection process complied with the MOU.
- Reviewed exceptions to the PTR review and verified compliance with the MOU.

- Verified completion of annual evaluations for tenured faculty in administrative roles, as required by the BOG regulation.
- Evaluated accuracy, completeness, and appropriateness of documentation considered within the PTR review.
- Ensured chair, dean, committee, and provost reviews were completed in accordance with the BOG regulation, UNF policy and MOU.
- Confirmed outcomes and compensation were in accordance with the MOU.
- Verified provost report contained required information and was provided to the President, Board of Trustees and UFF, as required by the MOU.

We conducted employee interviews, performed process and documentation reviews, and evaluated risks and their impact on outcomes.

Audit fieldwork began March 6, 2024, and concluded on May 29, 2024. We conducted the audit in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing published by the Institute of Internal Auditors (IIA). We relied on State of Florida Board of Governors Regulations, UNF Regulations and Policies, UNF-UFF Post-Tenure Faculty Review Memo of Understanding and best business practices to support strong internal controls.

Prior Audit Recommendations

Our examination generally includes a follow-up on observations and recommendations of prior internal audits, where the subjects of such findings are applicable to the scope of the current audit being performed. There were no prior internal audits pertinent to the post-tenure review.

Conclusion

The mission of the Office of Internal Auditing (OIA) is to provide independent, objective assurance and consulting activities that add value and help improve operations. We assessed the overall residual risk ranking as low, as no issues were identified which warranted areas of opportunities for improvement (as defined in [Appendix II](#)).

To summarize the PTR selection process, as of October 2, 2023, tenured faculty totaled 329. From this population, 185 faculty were properly removed prior to the random selection process because they were administrators, faculty promoted within the last five years, or up for promotion. The sample of tenured faculty for the first PTR review included 10 faculty promoted within 2018 and a randomly selected sample of 20% of the remaining 134 faculty within the population, or 27, resulting in a combined total of 37 faculty. Two faculty were properly removed from the sample due to retirement and approved leave, reducing the sample to 35.

The auditor performed a review of each of the 35 faculty's dossiers and validated the outcomes as summarized in Appendix I.

It is worth mentioning that the staff members involved in the audit demonstrated a high level of expertise in their respective areas. They promptly addressed inquiries and exhibited patience during the review process. We appreciate their cooperation and collaborative approach.

Appendix I

Post-Tenure Review Faculty Outcomes

Position	Exceeds Expectations	Meets Expectations	Does Not Meet Expectations	Unsatisfactory	Award
Professor	11				5% increase to base salary
Associate Professor	9				One-time, nonrecurring wage payment of 5% base pay or \$6,000, whichever is higher
Professor		2			One-time, nonrecurring wage payment of 3% base pay or \$4,000, whichever is higher
Associate Professor		11			One-time, nonrecurring wage payment of 3% base pay or \$4,000, whichever is higher
Professor			1		Faculty received notice of performance improvement plan
Professor				1	Faculty received notice of termination
Grand Total	20	13	1	1	

Appendix II

Report and Item Ranking Scale

Overall Report Residual Risk Ranking

- **Low**
 - The internal control system scoped within the audit is functioning satisfactorily, and remaining operating risks are low.
 - The collective audit issues are considered minor deficiencies.
 - Related corrective action need only be addressed to improve current operations.
- **Moderate**
 - The internal control system scoped within the audit is functioning in a manner that provides reasonable assurance that most major risks will be mitigated.
 - Corrective action to address the audit issues may not be critical to the university's business operations, but needs to be addressed to minimize financial, reputational, operational, and strategic risks.
- **High**
 - The internal control system scoped within the audit needs major improvement.
 - The deficiencies identified could significantly impair operations.
 - If corrective action is not implemented timely, issues may escalate to cause critical financial, reputational, operational, or strategic risks.
 - Corrective action plans should be given a priority.

Reportable Item Ranking Scale

- **Minor Risk [*Osprey Opportunity*]**
 - Observation reportable to address a nominal risk.
 - Recommendations provide opportunities for improvement.
 - Minor violations of procedures, rules, or regulations.
 - Routine administration attention requested.
 - Corrective action strongly recommended to improve quality or processes of area being audited.
- **Notable Risk**
 - Significant observation reportable to address an increased risk.
 - Multiple violations of policies and procedures, and/or weak internal controls.
 - Important opportunity to improve effectiveness and efficiency.
 - Corrective action required.
- **Critical Risk**
 - Major observation reportable due to a critical risk to the university.
 - Material violation of policies/procedures/laws, and/or unacceptable internal controls, and/or high risk for fraud/waste/abuse, and/or major opportunity to improve effectiveness and efficiency.
 - Material risk identified.
 - Immediate corrective action required.



Certification of Corrective Actions to Auditor General Findings of Statutory Non- Compliance

University Name: University of North Florida

INSTRUCTIONS: Please select the appropriate representation below and provide comments, if needed. Once completed, please insert signatures in the provided spaces and submit to the Board of Governors via the Information Request System by July 26, 2024.

Presidential Representation and Certification:

☒ The university has **completed** corrective actions in response to findings issued by the Auditor General during the 2023-2024 Fiscal Year that the university acted without statutory authority or contrary to general law.

Comments: Our corrective action in response to the finding involving student activity and service fees included a legal review to ensure our position and use of said funds were appropriate and legal. The legal review we received confirmed our understanding that the funds were appropriate and authorized. As such, reimbursement of these funds was deemed not necessary. The original audit response and subsequent legal review is attached.

☐ The university has **initiated** corrective actions in response to findings issued by the Auditor General during the 2023-2024 Fiscal Year that the university acted without statutory authority or contrary to general law and anticipates those actions will be completed by Click or tap to enter a date..

Comments: Click or tap here to enter text.

I certify that the representation provided above is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

Signature: _____
President

Date: _____

Board of Trustees Certifications:

I certify that the university's audit and compliance committee is kept informed of all audit findings issued by the Auditor General, as well as the university's actions to address those findings and come into compliance with applicable laws.

Signature: _____
Board of Trustees, Audit and Compliance Committee Chair

Date: _____

I certify that the representations made in this Certification are true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

Signature: _____
Board of Trustees, Chair

Date: _____

Approval of Tenure Upon Hire

Stephen W. Dittmore, Ph.D., Professor and Dean,
UNF College of Education and Human Services



- *Ph.D., Educational Leadership, University of Louisville*
- *Formerly Dean, College of Education and Health Services, Baldwin Wallace University (Ohio)*
- *Formerly Associate Dean for Research, Strategy and Innovation, College of Education and Health Professions, University of Arkansas*



**State University System
Education and General
2025-2026 Legislative Budget Request
Form I**

University(s): Request Title:	UNF Operational Support for Enrollment Growth & Florida's Supply Chain Economy
Date Request Approved by University Board of Trustees:	
Recurring Funds Requested:	\$20,000,000
Non-Recurring Funds Requested:	\$10,000,000
Total Funds Requested:	\$30,000,000
Please check the request type below:	
Shared Services/System-Wide Request	<input type="checkbox"/>
Unique Request	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>

I. Purpose –

- 1. Describe the overall purpose of the plan, specific goal(s) and metrics, specific activities that will help achieve the goal(s), and how these goals and initiatives align with strategic priorities and accountability plan established by each university (include whether this is a new or expanded service/program). If expanded, what has been accomplished with the current service/program?*

The strategic vision for UNF includes **enrollment growth to 25,000** by 2028 to serve the talent needs of the Northeast Florida region. This growth requires investment to secure faculty in key areas of economic growth in the region, student support services, research support and scholarships. Our region is one of the fastest growing in the country, creating a critical demand for expansion of the talent pipeline now. To reach this enrollment goal, UNF has a plan which requires operational support.

**Need to Grow Enrollment to Support the Region
and the State of FL with Strategic Emphasis**

- Jacksonville is the 2nd hottest job market in the country -*Wall Street Journal*
- In 2022, Jacksonville was the 5th fastest growing city in the country
- Future job growth in Jacksonville MSA is expected to increase 44.4% over the next 10 years
- Florida is poised to become one of the Top 5 manufacturing states by 2030

- Florida's manufacturing GDP has grown from \$43.5 billion in 2014 to \$73 billion in 2022 – nearly 70% in under a decade
- JAXPORT, with a \$33 billion output, is #1 for cargo shipping in Florida

With a recently approved Strategic Plan, UNF is undergoing a **realignment of programming** to better deliver on the specific workforce, innovation and research needs of Northeast Florida. This includes expanding our five strategic focus areas which mirror the economic development priorities of the region.

UNF Strategic Focus Areas	JAXUSA Partnership Priorities*
Advanced Manufacturing	Advanced Manufacturing
Transportation & Logistics	Transportation & Logistics (intermodal logistics)
Coastal Resilience (water to land technologies including port integrity)	
Computing, Cybersecurity, FinTech	Finance Technologies
Healthcare/Bio Med	Medical Device Manufacturing
	Health Tech

UNF's strategic focus areas are also integrated and related to **supply chain innovation and security (including advanced manufacturing, physical and cyber security, as well as transportation and logistics)**.

- Northeast Florida's strength in multi-modal transportation combined with UNF's success in this area is why UNF is working closely with supply chain, transportation, logistics, and military partners relative to research, innovation, curriculum development & talent fulfillment – both short and long term.
- One of the stated economic development goals of the Jacksonville Regional Chamber of Commerce (JAX Chamber) is to bring more advanced manufacturing to the State of Florida. Advanced manufacturing industries include aerospace, military, semiconductors/microelectronics and biomedical devices which rely on technologies like 3d printing, composites, and smart materials. As recognized in the recent Florida Manufacturing Report from FDOC, UNF is the *only* SUS institution providing a bachelor's degree (BS) in Advanced Manufacturing.**

The region's transportation and logistics infrastructure includes rail, air, maritime and highway that allow products manufactured here to be shipped anywhere in the world and offers companies same-day access to more than 98 million customers.* As each of these sectors grows, it is critical to support them with a highly specialized workforce to benefit the State of Florida.

*JAXUSA Partnership Strategic Plan

**2023 Florida Manufacturing Report from Florida Commerce Dept.

2. Describe any projected impact on academic programs, student enrollments, and student services.

Projected growth to 25,000 students has been carefully modeled to account for a combination of growing populations in undergraduate first-time-in-college students (FTICs), AA transfer students and graduate students at the masters and doctoral levels. The majority of faculty and research infrastructure requested will be dedicated toward cluster hires in programs aligned with the strategic areas described above, to build capacity to meet the growing workforce demands, while ensuring UNF's ability to provide research expertise to regional industry. Existing BS programs will be bolstered by teaching capacity and undergraduate research opportunities, while graduate programs will be provided the critical numbers of faculty to support both professional and research-based graduate degrees. State-of-the-art facilities in cybersecurity, manufacturing and process simulation, transportation modelling, and financial technology will equip faculty with the necessary research and teaching tools for applied, hands-on learning and innovation.

While the majority of the faculty positions created will focus on strategic areas described earlier, the remaining positions and new staff are critically needed to expand capacity in general education courses to account for the influx of new students, and the support staff necessary to provide academic guidance and other critical student success services. Focused efforts on recruiting and enrollment in these strategic focus areas will also be supported, however, as general awareness of UNF increases, many programs are expected to experience growth in enrollment, which has been considered in the needed positions.

Enrollment Trends in Key Strategic Areas

	Fall 2019	Fall 2020	Fall 2021	Fall 2022	Fall 2023
BS Advanced Manufacturing Engineering			1	14	16
MSCE Coastal and Port Engineering	9	7	8	5	7
BBA Transportation and Logistics	132	120	101	116	114
MS Logistics & Supply Chain Management	15	21	23	23	21
MS Business Analytics			26	73	101
BBA Business Intelligence			11	63	87
BS Biomedical Sciences			296	449	566
BBA Finance	456	499	456	479	483

	Fall 2019	Fall 2020	Fall 2021	Fall 2022	Fall 2023
Graduate Computing Programs	39	40	38	40	43
Undergraduate Computing Programs	754	823	714	970	981

	Fall 2019	Fall 2020	Fall 2021	Fall 2022	Fall 2023
Brooks College of Health Programs	3,212	3,130	3,134	3,082	3,088

Many of the programs in the table above are relatively young and only started admitting students in the last few years. These programs are expected to grow rapidly and currently do not possess the faculty necessary to support future student demand. Efforts in promotion and recruiting of these programs are already yielding year-over-year increases in student population. On the healthcare end of the spectrum, mature programs are at maximum capacity based on teaching resources and require an influx of new faculty to grow enrollment in these high demand fields.

II. Return on Investment - *Describe the outcome(s) anticipated, dashboard indicator(s) to be improved, or return on investment. Be specific. For example, if this issue focuses on improving retention rates, indicate the current retention rate and the expected increase in the retention rate. Similarly, if the issue focuses on expanding access to academic programs or student services, indicate the current and expected outcomes.*

UNF's Strong Return on Investment

- UNF leads the SUS with the highest % of graduates employed in Florida.
 - Approx. 80% of UNF graduates stay in Florida
 - 68.2% stay in the region
- UNF - nearly \$11 return for every state dollar invested
- In FY 2022, UNF's economic contribution in Florida exceeded \$1.375 billion
- As the only public research university in the region, UNF is the premier provider of talent for Northeast Florida
- Growing these programs to support the region will also increase our enrollment and completions in Programs of Strategic Emphasis to increase our outcomes in Performance Based Funding Metrics 6 and 8: Percentage of Bachelor's Degrees Awarded within Programs of Strategic Emphasis and Percentage of Graduate Degrees Awarded within Programs of Strategic Emphasis. This is needed with the realignment of Programs of Strategic Emphasis to ensure that UNF hits our goals of 40% and 44% respectively.
- Increasing completions in these areas will also have positive impacts to the two employment Performance Funding Metrics 1 and 2: Percent of Bachelor's Graduates Enrolled or Employed (\$40,000+) and Median Wages of Bachelor's Graduates Employed Full-time. UNF is striving to achieve 77% and \$49,100 respectively.

III. Personnel - *Describe personnel hiring and retention plans, making sure to connect both plans to initiative(s) and goal(s) described in section I. State the amount of faculty FTE and staff FTE and estimated funding amounts used for retention and new hires in each category. In describing faculty hires, provide overall hiring goals, including academic area(s) of expertise and anticipated hiring level (e.g. assistant*

professor, associate professor, full professor). Please describe how funds used for faculty or staff retention will help the institution achieve its stated goals.

Recurring funds will be used for:

- Recruitment of additional faculty with a focus on areas of strategic emphasis and cluster hires related to supply chain, logistics and cybersecurity
- Faculty to support growth expectations for additional healthcare professionals and educators, as well as expansion of core curriculum sections
- Staff support positions
- Research support and equipment maintenance
- Student services to support enrollment growth to 25,000 by 2028
 - Advisors
 - Mental health counselors
 - IT personnel
 - Campus police
 - Merit-based scholarships
- Graduate school program enhancements
- Undergraduate program alignment

Nonrecurring funds will be allocated for needed research infrastructure and lab upgrades in the following areas:

- Advanced manufacturing
- Computing, data analytics and cybersecurity
- Transportation and logistics modeling

IV. Facilities *(If this issue requires an expansion or construction of a facility, please complete the following table.):*

	Facility Project Title	Fiscal Year	Amount Requested	Priority Number
1.				
2.				

2025-2026 Legislative Budget Request
Education and General
Position and Fiscal Summary
Operating Budget Form II
(to be completed for each issue)

University: University of North FL
Issue Title: Growth, Supply Chain Economy

	RECURRING	NON-RECURRING	TOTAL
<u>Positions</u>			
Faculty	45	0	45
Other (A&P/USPS)	20	0	20
	-----	-----	-----
Total	65	0	65
	=====	=====	=====
Salaries and Benefits	\$11,400,000	\$0	\$11,400,000
Other Personal Services	\$3,200,000	\$0	\$3,200,000
Expenses	\$3,900,000	\$10,000,000	\$13,900,000
Operating Capital Outlay	\$0	\$0	\$0
Electronic Data Processing	\$0	\$0	\$0
Financial Aid	\$1,500,000	\$0	\$1,500,000
Special Category (Specific)	\$0	\$0	\$0
Equipment/Service	\$0	\$0	\$0
Marketing/Recruiting	\$0	\$0	\$0
OPS/Grad Assistantships	\$0	\$0	\$0
	-----	-----	-----
Total All Categories	\$20,000,000	\$10,000,000	\$30,000,000
	=====	=====	=====