

Self-Talk Rubric 5: Intellectual Mastery of Critical Analysis

	Rating
Student fulfills all the requirements of Rating 5 and further achieves a level of artistic mastery which results in a professionally publishable critique.	6
Student fulfills all the requirements of Rating 4 and further provides a more complex understanding of critique.	5
Student provides a critique which includes: (1) a detailed summary of the text, (2) his or her main point about the critique, (3) detailed background material relevant to his or her main point, (4) detailed analysis of several rhetorical criteria resulting in an evaluation of the author's success in achieving his or her purpose, (5) important implications and complications concerning the analysis, (6) a statement of his or her assumptions plus multiple implications and/or complications of those assumptions.	4
Student provides a critique which includes: (1) a more detailed summary of the text, (2) his or her main point about the critique, (3) detailed background material relevant to his or her main point, (4) analysis of several rhetorical criteria resulting in an evaluation of the author's success in achieving his or her purpose, (5) a statement of his or her assumptions and at least one implication or complication of those assumptions .	3
Student provides a critique which includes: (1) a simple summary of the text, (2) his or her main point about the critique, (3) some background material relevant to his or her main point, (4) limited analysis of rhetorical criteria for the evaluation of the author's success in achieving his or her purpose, (5) a simple statement of his or her assumptions.	2
Student provides a simple factual statement for a critique (i.e., the author does or does not achieve his or her purpose) <i>or</i> provides a descriptive, personal statement (the article was informative, exciting, boring, etc.) but does not provide any one or several of the following: (1) an accurate summary of the text <i>and/or</i> , (2) his or her main point about the critique <i>and/or</i> , (3) analysis of rhetorical criteria for the evaluation of the author's success in achieving his or her purpose <i>and/or</i> , (4) statement of his or her assumptions.	1
Student indicates a faulty understanding of critique.	0

Features of Critical Analysis/Critique

- Includes an accurate summary of the text
- States the author's main point
- States the main point of the student writer's critique
- Includes background material relevant to the student writer's main point
- Analyzes rhetorical criteria to evaluate the validity of the author's success in achieving his or her purpose for a specific audience
- Includes a statement of the student writer's assumptions